



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF AUGUST 13, 2007
Hyatt Regency Hotel, Regency Ballroom J
600 Towne Center Drive, Dearborn, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The August 13, 2007 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:07 a.m. in Regency Ballroom J of the Hyatt Regency Hotel, 600 Towne Center Drive, Dearborn, Michigan.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member
Raman A. Patel, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the July 23 and 24, 2007 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. C. Jan Markowski addressed the Board to outline his request on behalf of the Michigan Assessors Association (MAA) for approval of six-hour renewal credit for a new course on economic condition factor and land value analysis. Mr. Markowski also mentioned two other MAA classes—one on appraising single-family residential property and one on the application of new, loss, additions, losses, and adjustment—and inquired regarding the possibility of these courses receiving approval for six-hour renewal credit.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to give approval to a request for six hours of renewal credit for a program titled "The Land Conservation Real Estate Marketplace I".
2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant the request of Mr. Markowski on behalf of the MAA for six hours of renewal credit (for 2007 only) for the course titled "ECF and Land Value Analysis".
3. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to receive and file an informational communication from the Executive Secretary regarding six-hour renewal evaluations.
4. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to deny the level 3 experience qualification request of Ms. Julie A. Cain-Derouin.
5. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to give approval to the level 3 experience qualification request of Ms. Catherine A. Cousineau.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS (Continued):

6. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt a fee of \$18.50 to offset the cost of providing editions of The Appraisal Foundation's *Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice and Advisory Opinions* as part of home study courses and mail-in renewal programs.

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:

1. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to (1) reconsider the Board's July 2007 action regarding the determination of the certification level status of individual units of government due to a lack of available 2007 valuation data; (2) adopt the updated certification level requirements for Townships, Cities, and Counties as presented; and (3) using 2006 valuation data to determine the certification level status of individual units of government, notify units of government affected by the new certification level requirements.

2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to (1) take no action with regard to the request of Baraga County for a 12-month conditional extension under Michigan Compiled Law 211.10d and (2) provide formal notification to the assessing officer currently serving as the equalization director of Baraga County regarding her under-certified status.

3. The Board received information from the Executive Secretary regarding the progress of the Kalkaska County equalization director toward achieving level 3 certification.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

Certification Applicants August 3, 2007

Level 1

Kandalec, Kimm
Nelson, Nick

Tuttle, John A.

Willmes, Ronald

Level 2

Aiello, Michelle M.
Bacinski, Mary Jane

Gooch, Elizabeth A.
Pless, Lu Ann

Rocheleau, Marcia Ann
Willmes, Ronald

Level 3

Marshall, Amanda B.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS (Continued):

Certification Totals August 3, 2007

Level 1	618
Level 2	967
Level 3	876
Level 4	<u>147</u>
Total	2,608

FIRST CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, Morgan—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

The closed session was held and the following items were reviewed by the Board:

1. Closed meeting minutes from July 23, 2007
2. Request by an individual to become a narrative appraisal grader
3. Request for an extension to complete level 4 certification requirements
4. Request to change the form of obsolescence for a second narrative appraisal submission
5. Revocation petition 07-0002
6. Revocation petition 07-0009
7. Revocation petition 07-0010
8. Revocation petitions 07-0011 through 07-0020

A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, Morgan—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

MEETING RECESS: The meeting recessed at 10:25 a.m. to allow Chairperson Hobart to present the Board's 2007 Annual Report at the annual meeting of the Michigan Assessors Association. The meeting reconvened at 11:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member
Raman A. Patel, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

SECOND CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(k).) A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, Morgan—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

The closed session was held and narrative appraisal 197, second grading, was reviewed by the Board.

A motion was made by Patel and seconded by Morgan to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, Morgan—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes from July 23, 2007 as presented.
2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved (1) to have the Board interview the individual requesting to become a narrative appraisal grader, (2) (assuming a successful interview) to have the individual then meet with Board member Patel and the Executive Secretary to discuss general narrative appraisal grading issues, (3) to have the individual re-grade a narrative appraisal that has already been graded before assigning a narrative appraisal to the individual for actual grading, and (4) to have the individual's first grading effort be shadow graded to help ensure quality grading by the individual.
3. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to table the request for an extension to complete level 4 certification requirements so that additional information relating to the request can be obtained.
4. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant the request to change the form of obsolescence for a second narrative appraisal submission.
5. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to table the matter of narrative appraisal 197, second grading, to obtain additional information.
6. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 07-0002.
7. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 07-0009.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS (Continued):

8. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to notify the assessing officer named in revocation petition 07-0010 of the petition and to request the Assessment and Certification Division of the Department of Treasury to investigate the allegations contained in the petition.

9. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petitions 07-0011 through 07-0020.

COMMUNICATIONS: A letter from Mr. William D. Griffin expressing thanks on behalf of the Oakland County Association of Assessing Officers for the Board's support of the association's annual golf outing was discussed.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant the Executive Secretary of the State Tax Commission access to revocation petition information and files.

2. The hold placed on expense reimbursements for Board members was discussed.

3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to move the September meeting of the Board from September 20, 2007 at 9:30 a.m. to September 24, 2007 at 10:00 a.m.

4. The Executive Secretary briefed the Board on plans to post the level 3 and 4 course credit status of assessing officers on the Web page devoted to the State Assessors Board. Specifically, it was noted that posting this information on the Web page will result in administrative efficiencies and improved service to assessing officers.

5. Discussion occurred regarding the Executive Secretary compiling a list of level 4 assessing officers who are active in assessment administration and providing the list to the Board.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for September 24, 2007 at 10:00 a.m. in the first floor Bond Finance Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Date minutes typed: August 17, 2007

Date minutes approved: 9-24-07



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson